

64-5528

PAULSON, Leonard Evert, 1916-  
EVALUATION OF MUSIC PROGRAMS IN  
SELECTED SECONDARY SCHOOLS OF  
NEBRASKA.

The University of Nebraska Teachers College  
Ed.D., 1963  
Music

University Microfilms, Inc., Ann Arbor, Michigan

Copyright by  
LEONARD EVERT PAULSON  
1964

PREVIEW

PREVIEW

EVALUATION OF MUSIC PROGRAMS IN SELECTED  
SECONDARY SCHOOLS OF NEBRASKA

by

Leonard E. Paulson

A DISSERTATION

Presented to the Faculty of

The University of Nebraska in the Teachers College

in Partial Fulfillment of Requirements

For the Degree of Doctor of Education

Department of Secondary Education

Under the Supervision of Professor Gayle Childs

Lincoln, Nebraska

1963

PREVIEW

TITLE

Evaluation of Music Programs in Selected

Secondary Schools of Nebraska

BY

Leonard E. Paulson

IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF REQUIREMENTS  
FOR THE  
DOCTOR OF EDUCATION DEGREE

APPROVED BY

DATE

Gayle B. Childs, Chm.

July 27, 1963

Norman F. Thorpe

July 27, 1963

Emanuel Wishnow

July 27, 1963

Donald O. Clifton

July 27, 1963

Rex K. Reckewey

July 27, 1963

SUPERVISORY COMMITTEE

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The writer wishes to express his gratitude to the people who made this study possible. In particular, he wishes to acknowledge his debt to Dr. Gayle B. Childs, his sponsor, whose kindly and patient guidance and friendly counsel was a major factor in bringing the study into being. Without his advice and constructive assistance, the writer might well have faltered. To Professor Galen Saylor he owes a special debt of gratitude for the assistance, encouragement, and wise counsel given so generously throughout the preliminary planning period. Special gratitude is due also to the other members of the supervisory committee, Professors Don O. Clifton, Emanuel Wishnow, Rex K. Reckewey, and Norman F. Thorpe, for their help and cooperation.

To Dr. Milton D. Evans and Eldon Hesket, who volunteered their services as team experts, the writer owes much.

To the many others whose evidence of interest has been stimulating, the writer expresses his appreciation.

And to his wife, Mary, whose patience and help has made this study possible, the writer expresses his most devoted thanks and praise.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<u>Chapter</u>	<u>Page</u>
I. ORGANIZATION AND PLAN OF THE STUDY . . . . .	1
Introduction . . . . .	1
The Problem . . . . .	2
Definition of Terms . . . . .	3
Procedures Used in the Study . . . . .	3
Significance of the Study . . . . .	5
Delimitations of the Problem . . . . .	6
II. BACKGROUND FOR THE STUDY . . . . .	8
Historical Development of Music in High Schools . . . . .	8
Previous Research . . . . .	16
III. PRINCIPLES OF MUSIC EDUCATION AS RELATED TO SECONDARY SCHOOLS . . . . .	20
Introduction . . . . .	20
Purpose of the Chapter . . . . .	21
Determination of Principles . . . . .	22
Jury Evaluation . . . . .	41
IV. EVALUATION OF THE MUSIC PROGRAM IN CLASS C SECONDARY SCHOOLS . . . . .	42
Principle 1 . . . . .	50
Principle 2 . . . . .	52
Principle 3 . . . . .	57
Principle 4 . . . . .	59
Principle 5 . . . . .	62
Principle 6 . . . . .	64
Principle 7 . . . . .	65
Principle 8 . . . . .	69
Principle 9 . . . . .	71
Principle 10 . . . . .	75
Principle 11 . . . . .	79
Principle 12 . . . . .	82
Summary . . . . .	86



## Table of Contents (Continued)

<u>Chapter</u>	<u>Page</u>
V. EVALUATION OF THE MUSIC PROGRAM IN CLASS A SECONDARY SCHOOLS . . . . .	88
Principle 1 . . . . .	89
Principle 2 . . . . .	98
Principle 3 . . . . .	102
Principle 4 . . . . .	104
Principle 5 . . . . .	106
Principle 6 . . . . .	110
Principle 7 . . . . .	112
Principle 8 . . . . .	114
Principle 9 . . . . .	116
Principle 10 . . . . .	119
Principle 11 . . . . .	123
Principle 12 . . . . .	126
Summary . . . . .	131
VI. EVALUATION OF THE MUSIC PROGRAM BY A SELECTED TEAM OF EDUCATORS . . . . .	133
Principle 1 . . . . .	134
Principle 2 . . . . .	136
Principle 3 . . . . .	138
Principle 4 . . . . .	139
Principle 5 . . . . .	141
Principle 6 . . . . .	143
Principle 7 . . . . .	145
Principle 8 . . . . .	147
Principle 9 . . . . .	148
Principle 10 . . . . .	150
Principle 11 . . . . .	153
Principle 12 . . . . .	154
Summary . . . . .	157
VII. FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS . . . . .	159
Summary of Procedure . . . . .	159
Findings . . . . .	160
Conclusions . . . . .	168
BIBLIOGRAPHY . . . . .	171
APPENDICES . . . . .	175
Appendix A . . . . .	175
Appendix B . . . . .	177
Appendix C . . . . .	181
Appendix D . . . . .	238
Appendix E . . . . .	295
Appendix F . . . . .	310

## TABLES

<u>Table</u>	<u>Page</u>
1. Nature of The Band Program in The Class C Schools.	45
2. Nature of The Choir Program in The Class C Schools . . . . .	47
3. Nature of The Girls' Glee Club Program in The Class C Schools . . . . .	48
4. Nature of The Boys' Glee Club Program in The Class C Schools . . . . .	49
5. Evaluation of The Eight Class C Schools in Terms of Criteria Related to Principle 1 . . . . .	53
6. Evaluation of The Eight Class C Schools in Terms of Criteria Related to Principle 2 . . . . .	56
7. Evaluation of The Eight Class C Schools in Terms of Criteria Related to Principle 3 . . . . .	58
8. Evaluation of The Eight Class C Schools in Terms of Criteria Related to Principle 4 . . . . .	61
9. Evaluation of The Eight Class C Schools in Terms of Criteria Related to Principle 5 . . . . .	63
10. Evaluation of The Eight Class C Schools in Terms of Criteria Related to Principle 6 . . . . .	66
11. Evaluation of The Eight Class C Schools in Terms of Criteria Related to Principle 7 . . . . .	68
12. Evaluation of The Eight Class C Schools in Terms of Criteria Related to Principle 8 . . . . .	70
13. Evaluation of The Eight Class C Schools in Terms of Criteria Related to Principle 9 . . . . .	74
14. Evaluation of The Eight Class C Schools in Terms of Criteria Related to Principle 10 . . . . .	77
15. Evaluation of The Eight Class C Schools in Terms of Criteria Related to Principle 11 . . . . .	81

## Tables (Continued)

<u>Tables</u>	<u>Page</u>
16. Evaluation of The Eight Class C Schools in Terms of Criteria Related to Principle 12 . . . . .	85
17. Average Ratings of The Eight Class C Schools in Terms of Principles Related to the Study . . . . .	87
18. Nature of The Band Program in The Class A Schools . . . . .	90
19. Nature of The Orchestra Program in The Class A Schools . . . . .	91
20. Nature of The Choir Program in The Class A Schools . . . . .	92
21. Nature of The Girls' Glee Club Program in The Class A Schools . . . . .	93
22. Nature of The Boys' Glee Club Program in The Class A Schools . . . . .	94
23. Evaluation of The Eight Class A Schools in Terms of Criteria Related to Principle 1 . . . . .	97
24. Evaluation of The Eight Class A Schools in Terms of Criteria Related to Principle 2 . . . . .	101
25. Evaluation of The Eight Class A Schools in Terms of Criteria Related to Principle 3 . . . . .	103
26. Evaluation of The Eight Class A Schools in Terms of Criteria Related to Principle 4 . . . . .	107
27. Evaluation of The Eight Class A Schools in Terms of Criteria Related to Principle 5 . . . . .	109
28. Evaluation of The Eight Class A Schools in Terms of Criteria Related to Principle 6 . . . . .	111
29. Evaluation of The Eight Class A Schools in Terms of Criteria Related to Principle 7 . . . . .	113
30. Evaluation of The Eight Class A Schools in Terms of Criteria Related to Principle 8 . . . . .	115

## Tables (Continued)

<u>Table</u>	<u>Page</u>
31. Evaluation of The Eight Class A Schools in Terms of Criteria Related to Principle 9 . . . . .	118
32. Evaluation of The Eight Class A Schools in Terms of Criteria Related to Principle 10 . . . . .	122
33. Evaluation of The Eight Class A Schools in Terms of Criteria Related to Principle 11 . . . . .	125
34. Evaluation of The Eight Class A Schools in Terms of Criteria Related to Principle 12 . . . . .	130
35. Average Ratings of The Eight Class A Schools in Terms of Principles Related to the Study . . . .	132
36. Ratings of The Investigator and The Team Members of Criteria Under Principle 1 for Case 3 of The Class C Schools . . . . .	134
37. Ratings of The Investigator and The Team Members of Criteria Under Principle 1 for Case 1 of The Class A Schools . . . . .	135
38. Ratings of The Investigator and The Team Members of Criteria Under Principle 2 for Case 3 of The Class C Schools . . . . .	136
39. Ratings of The Investigator and The Team Members of Criteria Under Principle 2 for Case 1 of The Class A Schools . . . . .	137
40. Ratings of The Investigator and The Team Members of Criteria Under Principle 3 for Case 3 of The Class C Schools . . . . .	138
41. Ratings of The Investigator and The Team Members of Criteria Under Principle 3 for Case 1 of The Class A Schools . . . . .	139
42. Ratings of The Investigator and The Team Members of Criteria Under Principle 4 for Case 3 of The Class C Schools . . . . .	140
43. Ratings of The Investigator and The Team Members of Criteria Under Principle 4 for Case 1 of The Class A Schools . . . . .	141

## Tables (Continued)

<u>Table</u>		<u>Page</u>
44.	Ratings of The Investigator and The Team Members of Criteria Under Principle 5 for Case 3 of The Class C Schools . . . . .	142
45.	Ratings of The Investigator and The Team Members of Criteria Under Principle 5 for Case 1 of The Class A Schools . . . . .	143
46.	Ratings of The Investigator and The Team Members of Criteria Under Principle 6 for Case 3 of The Class C Schools . . . . .	144
47.	Ratings of The Investigator and The Team Members of Criteria Under Principle 6 for Case 1 of The Class A Schools . . . . .	144
48.	Ratings of The Investigator and The Team Members of Criteria Under Principle 7 for Case 3 of The Class C Schools . . . . .	145
49.	Ratings of The Investigator and The Team Members of Criteria Under Principle 7 for Case 1 of The Class A Schools . . . . .	146
50.	Ratings of The Investigator and The Team Members of Criteria Under Principle 8 for Case 3 of The Class C Schools . . . . .	147
51.	Ratings of The Investigator and The Team Members of Criteria Under Principle 8 for Case 1 of The Class A Schools . . . . .	148
52.	Ratings of The Investigator and The Team Members of Criteria Under Principle 9 for Case 3 of The Class C Schools . . . . .	149
53.	Ratings of The Investigator and The Team Members of Criteria Under Principle 9 for Case 1 of The Class A Schools . . . . .	150
54.	Ratings of The Investigator and The Team Members of Criteria Under Principle 10 for Case 3 of The Class C Schools . . . . .	151

## Tables (Continued)

<u>Table</u>	<u>Page</u>
55. Ratings of The Investigator and The Team Members of Criteria Under Principle 10 for Case 1 of The Class A Schools . . . . .	152
56. Ratings of The Investigator and The Team Members of Criteria Under Principle 11 for Case 3 of The Class C Schools . . . . .	153
57. Ratings of The Investigator and The Team Members of Criteria Under Principle 11 for Case 1 of The Class A Schools . . . . .	154
58. Ratings of The Investigator and The Team Members of Criteria Under Principle 12 for Case 3 of The Class C Schools . . . . .	155
59. Ratings of The Investigator and The Team Members of Criteria Under Principle 12 for Case 1 of The Class A Schools . . . . .	156
60. Average Ratings of The Investigator and The Team Members of The Twelve Principles for Case 3 of The Class C Schools . . . . .	157
61. Average Ratings of The Investigator and The Team Members of The Twelve Principles for Case 1 of The Class A Schools . . . . .	158

PREVIEW

## CHAPTER I

### ORGANIZATION AND PLAN OF THE STUDY

#### Introduction

The period from 1930 to 1961 has been a dramatic change in the curriculum of the secondary school. At the earlier date educators were satisfied to abide by a definition that limits curriculum to "courses of study."<sup>1</sup> This definition does not take into account the many experiences that lie beyond the influence of limiting courses of study.

Today this course of study definition is rejected by educators because they recognize that, in practice, it denies the fundamental idea that persons are different and that they learn in different ways and by different means. Music has been tested along with other school subjects for its relative educational value and has not been found wanting. The conscientious, intelligent study of child-nature, its laws and needs, leads us to realize that music as an outlet for ideas, thoughts, and emotions, will continue to be given a place of importance in the school curriculum.

Another reason for the enormous increase in musical

---

<sup>1</sup>Keith D. Snyder, School Music Administration and Supervision (Boston: Allyn and Bacon, Inc., 1959), p. 70.



offerings in high schools is the change in attitude of the people of the United States toward music. There has come to be a realization that nearly everyone can learn to play or to sing well enough to derive considerable satisfaction from the activity. One of the basic aims of music education today is to develop more discrimination and more intelligent selection of music. We expect "Musical Appreciation" to carry over into "Life Appreciation."<sup>2</sup>

During the past three decades almost all secondary schools have developed some type of music program. Music education seems to be concerned with music as an art, as a social force, and as a psychological conditioner.

In accordance with these beliefs it seems important to re-evaluate our present program and try to find out how Nebraska secondary schools measure up to accepted standards in music education.

### The Problem

The purpose of this study is to analyze the music programs in schools selected as representative of public high schools in Nebraska, and to evaluate their practices and procedures on the basis of principles and criteria accepted as valid for music education programs.

---

<sup>2</sup>Lilla Belle Pitts, Music Integration in the Junior High School (Boston: C. C. Birchard and Company, 1938), p. 1.

## Definition of Terms

Criteria--Standards by which to determine the correctness of a judgment or evaluation.

Music Education--A concept which takes into account a sustained reasonable and ever growing musical development of girls and boys, a concept in which music is not an isolated area of instruction but a significant part of the education of all the pupils in the secondary schools.

Principle--In this study, the term principle shall be defined as a comprehensive statement which characterizes or states desirable properties.

## Procedures Used in The Study

This study began with a review of the literature in the field of music education for the purpose of establishing a list of principles which would have relevance for an investigation of this type.

A list of thirteen principles was developed and sent to a representative jury of nationally recognized experts in the field (see appendix A) who have had extensive experience with all phases of music education with the request that they evaluate the principles developed. On the basis of this jury evaluation one of the principles was eliminated.

Finally, a set of criteria, for each of the remaining twelve principles, was evolved applicable to the evaluation

of music in the secondary schools. The evaluative criteria, 1960 edition, from the National Study of Secondary School Evaluation, Washington 6, D. C. was used as a guide. These criteria are listed in appendix C.

The data for this study was obtained entirely through the use of the interview technique. In order to be practicable, sixteen schools were chosen, eight from class A as representative of large high schools, and eight from class C as representative of small high schools.

The next step involved visiting each of sixteen secondary schools and obtaining many kinds of information pertinent to evaluation, including interviews with all music faculty responsible for the high school music program, in order to obtain the following types of information:

1. Courses in the music curriculum
2. Time allotted to each course
3. Number of concerts during the year
4. Types of performances
5. Number of graduating seniors who participated in the music program
6. Amount of credit received
7. Equipment
8. Budget
9. Practice arrangements
10. Fulfilling the needs of the musically gifted
11. Fulfilling the needs of the average child
12. Testing and guidance
13. Recreational music
14. Community support

After the interviews were tabulated and analyzed the school music programs of the representative high schools were evaluated on the basis of the principles and criteria previously established.

In order to test the validity of the survey results, a team of experts, chosen from educational leaders in Nebraska, was requested to visit two of the schools selected in the study and to evaluate the music program on the basis of the established principles and criteria.

A comparison of the team analysis with the evaluation of the writer will be discussed later in the study.

### Significance of the Study

If the definition of music education used in this study is valid, there seems to be some doubt about the real purpose of some secondary programs. Is every child being given a background in the arts, is the school developing within the individual a desire to continue aesthetic enjoyment after graduation, and is music helping to develop a better society?

The American culture is living, moving and dynamic. A culture that is dynamic must change in order to meet the ever changing needs of the youth of that society. Keith D. Snyder makes the following pertinent observation:<sup>3</sup>

Today, learning is known to involve the entire person--his social, mental, emotional, and physical being. Interest must be keen in the content or subject matter of learning, as well as in the activities that promote it. Also, the results of learning--new skills, new attitudes, new knowledge, new insights--must be clearly recognizable to the learner. He must be aware of all these while he learns.

---

<sup>3</sup>Snyder, op. cit., p. 77.

The panic that first gripped the world immediately following the launching of the first satellite has subsided. Reason has once again replaced emotional reaction. While educators are aware of their responsibilities for developing interest in the scientific fields among young people who have the aptitude, they are also aware of the necessity for developing human relations and the humanities which have to do with the development of values and value-judgment. President Eisenhower pointed out that while the need for more and better training in the exact sciences is obvious, the greater need will be ". . . a people who will keep their heads and, in every field, leaders who can meet intricate human problems with courage and wisdom."<sup>4</sup>

It seems important that the music education program in Nebraska be re-evaluated to see whether or not its present status can be justified on the basis of realization of broad educational goals.

#### Delimitations of the Problem

The study was limited to an analysis of the music programs conducted by sixteen schools, eight chosen from class A and eight from class C. Schools in each class were selected

---

<sup>4</sup>Music Educators National Conference, Music in the Senior High School (1201 sixteenth St., N. W. Washington 6, D. C., 1959), p. 13.

from a list included in the Nebraska School Activities Association Bulletin - November, 1961.

Schools were classified according to rules outlined in the Nebraska School Activities Association official year book - 1961. Article I - M, section 1, states:

Schools shall be divided into four classes with classification based on the enrollment in grades nine to twelve inclusive as of the sixth day of the current school year.

Class A-----Enrollment of over 400  
Class B-----Enrollment of 151 to 400 inclusive  
Class C-----Enrollment of 76 to 150 inclusive  
Class D-----Enrollment of 75 or fewer

In order to assure a fair geographical representation these schools were chosen at random, two from each Judicial District, and four at large.

## CHAPTER II

### BACKGROUND FOR THE STUDY

#### Historical Development of Music in High Schools

Many colonists came to America seeking religious freedom; as a part of that heritage hymn singing played a vital role. One of the first singing books published in America was the "Bay Song Book," in 1640.

In 1700 the Episcopal Church of Port Royal, Virginia imported a pipe organ and the Reverend John Tufts published the first practical instruction book in singing. As a result the art of music reading was developed and the better singers in the congregations tended to sit together.

In an attempt to improve church music singing, schools were originated in 1720. These schools were directed on a part time basis in homes, churches, and school rooms for a modest fee. Among the first singing school masters were men such as Francis Hopkinson, and Lowell Mason. These singing schools, then, are credited with developing and maintaining an interest in music for the next one hundred years.<sup>1</sup>

Lowell Mason (1792-1872), a native of Medfield,

---

<sup>1</sup>Charles Leonhard and Robert House, Foundations and Principles of Music Education (New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, Inc., 1959), pp. 49-50.

Massachusetts, is aptly called the Father of Public School Music in America.<sup>2</sup> His dedication to music, his interest in the methods and works of Pestalozzi, and the encouragement given by his friend Horace Mann, resulted in the first public school music in America. The Boston city council passed a resolution, on September 18, 1837, recommending that music be made a public school study. Mason was so dedicated to the cause that he took full charge of one school with no salary.

The following outline of "Principles of the Pestalozzian System of Music" used by Lowell Mason and presented to the American Institute of Instruction meeting in Boston in 1830 is quoted below:<sup>3</sup>

1. To teach sounds before signs and to make the child learn to sing before he learns the written notes or their names;
2. To lead him to observe by hearing and imitating sounds, their resemblances and differences, their agreeable and disagreeable effect, instead of explaining these things to him--in a work, to make active instead of passive learning;
3. To teach but one thing at a time--rhythm, melody, and expression to be taught and practiced separately, before the child is called to the difficult task of attending to all at once;
4. In making him practice each step of each of these divisions, until he is master of it, before passing to the next;

---

<sup>2</sup>Hazel Beckwith Nohavec, Normal Music Methods (Lincoln, Nebraska; University Publishing Company, 1926), p. 2.

<sup>3</sup>Charles Leonhard and Robert House, Foundations and Principles of Music Education (New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, Inc., 1959), p. 52, citing Will S. Monroe, History of the Pestalozzian Movement in the United States, C. W. Bardeen, Syracuse, 1907, p. 93.