

AIRBORNE INFECTION IN HEALTHCARE ENVIRONMENTS:
IMPLICATIONS TO HOSPITAL CORRIDOR DESIGN

by

Seyed Ehsan Mousavi Rizi

A DISSERTATION

Presented to the Faculty of

The Graduate College at the University of Nebraska

In Partial Fulfillment of Requirements

For the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Major: Engineering

(Construction Engineering and Management)

Under the Supervision of Professor Kevin R. Grosskopf

Lincoln, Nebraska

July, 2015

UMI Number: 3715387

All rights reserved

INFORMATION TO ALL USERS

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.



UMI 3715387

Published by ProQuest LLC (2015). Copyright in the Dissertation held by the Author.

Microform Edition © ProQuest LLC.

All rights reserved. This work is protected against unauthorized copying under Title 17, United States Code



ProQuest LLC.
789 East Eisenhower Parkway
P.O. Box 1346
Ann Arbor, MI 48106 - 1346

AIRBORNE INFECTION IN HEALTHCARE ENVIRONMENTS: IMPLICATIONS TO HOSPITAL CORRIDOR DESIGN

Seyed Ehsan Mousavi Rizi, Ph.D.

University of Nebraska, 2015

Advisor: Kevin R. Grosskopf

Several studies have linked nosocomial transmission airborne diseases to airflow in healthcare settings. Quasi-experimental methods are developed to observe the aerodynamic transport behavior of synthetic respiratory particles in corridors of a hospital. Computational models, validated by experimental results, are then developed to explore the spatial relationships of supply-exhaust air ventilation in patient corridors. The aim of this study is to determine optimal HVAC design strategies to contain and remove airborne contaminants in healthcare environments.

In addition to occupant comfort, hospital HVAC systems are designed to provide ventilation and directional airflow to contain, dilute and remove contaminants including airborne disease. Of 183 epidemiological studies published worldwide from 1960-2005, however, only 10 studies were deemed by a panel of international experts as having conclusively demonstrated the effectiveness of ventilation to control the spread of airborne disease in healthcare settings.

Two experimental tests were conducted; one placing patient corridors under directional airflow and the second placing the corridors under non-directional airflow. The purpose

of these tests was to observe the spatial-temporal movement of artificially-generated aerosols with respect to particle size and ventilation mode and to assess the probability of contamination from infectious sources inside and outside of the patient area. Next, computational fluid dynamic (CFD) models were developed and validated by experimental results to test several ventilation rates with modified supply-exhaust air system configurations in patient corridors.

Results suggest that dissemination of bio-aerosols in hospital corridors could be exacerbated by directional airflow caused by either the spatial arrangement of supply-exhaust air ventilation, or, the pressure relationship between the corridor and surroundings spaces. Within the non-directional or 'neutral' airflow regime, modified supply-exhaust air system configurations reduced average particle concentration 30% and transport distance more than 60% without increasing air change rate. Aerosols $\leq 0.5\mu\text{m}$, however, were observed more than 30m from the source with comparatively less regard to airflow mode or supply-exhaust air system configuration. Ventilation arrangements can potentially reduce concentrations and improve distributions of particles. And, higher ventilation rates do not necessarily culminate in better results.

To
Whom I wish to come soon

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I would like to express my sincere thanks and gratitude to my committee chair Professor Kevin Grosskopf for his advice, precious time and constant support throughout my career at the University of Nebraska-Lincoln. Not only has he been an outstanding advisor, he has also been my best friend throughout my PhD studies at UNL. He continually conveyed the spirit of adventure in regard to research and scholarship, and excitement in the process to becoming a better human being.

I truly appreciate the valuable input and comments made by my committee members Professor Terry Stentz, Professor Josephine Lau, and Professor David Yuill without which my efforts would not have been complete and fruitful. My deep appreciation to Professor Timothy Wentz for his kind and supporting behavior towards me during my stay at Nebraska, and for being a spectacular teacher from which all students have benefitted over a course of many years. I would like to acknowledge the many other professors and instructors at the University of Nebraska who dedicate their lives to the teaching and service of others.

To my wife, Negin, who has patiently endured many days of my impatience, petulance, and short-temperedness. She convinced me to pursue this education, supported me to complete it, and certainly will be on my side as I develop the next level of my career.

Finally, I would like to express the deepest appreciation to my parents for their unconditional love, financial and moral support.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF FIGURES	ix
LIST OF TABLES	xvii
LIST OF SYMBOLS	xxi
LIST OF ACRONYMS	xxiv
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Context of the Problem	2
1.2.1 Healthcare Associated Infection (HAI)	2
1.2.2 Energy Consumption	3
1.3 Research Question Development	4
1.4 Research Design	6
1.5 Dissertation Organization	6
CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW	8
2.1 Infection in Hospitals	8
2.2 Theoretical Background and Considerations	19
2.2.1 Viscous Fluid flow Formulation	19

2.2.2	Particle Track Formulation	23
CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY		26
3.1	Experimental Location and Description.....	26
3.2	Quasi-Experimental Method	30
3.2.1	Neutral mode.....	33
3.2.2	Negative Mode.....	34
3.3	Computational Modeling Method	35
3.3.1	Discretization and Mesh	35
3.3.2	Material Properties.....	39
3.3.3	Modeling and Solver.....	39
3.3.4	Boundary Conditions	40
3.3.5	Particle Tracking.....	46
3.4	Model Validation.....	46
3.5	Computational Scenarios.....	50
3.5.1	Ventilation Arrangement (Existing versus Modified Configurations)	50
3.5.2	Directional versus Non-Directional Flow	51
3.5.3	Ventilation Rates.....	51
CHAPTER 4: QUASI-EXPERIMENTAL RESULTS.....		54
4.1	Flow Direction.....	54

4.2	Particle Size.....	57
4.3	Probability of Transport.....	58
CHAPTER 5: COMPUTATIONAL MODELING RESULTS		60
5.1	Preliminary Findings.....	60
5.2	Flow Direction.....	62
5.2.1	Concentrations	62
5.2.2	Distributions.....	68
5.3	Ventilation Rate.....	104
5.3.1	Concentrations	104
5.3.2	Distributions.....	114
CHAPTER 6: CONCLUSIONS		140
6.1	Summary and Conclusions.....	140
6.2	Future Work and Limitations	144
REFERENCES		147

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1-1 Hospital Energy Use by Source ¹¹	3
Figure 1-2 ASHRAE Standard 170, Design Parameters	4
Figure 2-1 Drag Coefficient versus Reynold Number	24
Figure 3-1 Exterior View of Hospital	27
Figure 3-2 General Patient Ward Corridors, NUCON F-1000-DD Aerosol Detector and Aerosol Sampling Equipment	27
Figure 3-3 General Patient Ward Plan, the 'Bed Tower'	28
Figure 3-4 General Patient Ward Mechanical Plan	29
Figure 3-5 Particle Size Distribution of NUCON SN-10 Pneumatic Aerosol Generator.	30
Figure 3-6 Particle Sampling Locations in General Patient Ward Corridors	31
Figure 3-7 Particle Sampling Equipment in General Patient Ward Corridors. Sampling Locations A1 (left) and B1 (right) Shown at Entrance to Patient Area at 0.6m, 1.2m, and 1.8m Sampling Heights Respectively. Aerosol Generator Approximately 3.3m Behind Closed Doors	33
Figure 3-8 Scaled Residuals for Conserved Variables	36
Figure 3-9 Weighted Average Velocity Field Convergence	37

Figure 3-10 Total Static Pressure for Exhaust Fan 3	38
Figure 3-11 Drag Coefficient on Walls	38
Figure 3-12 Boundary Conditions in General Patient Ward Corridors	40
Figure 3-13. Simulation of the slot diffuser with (a) the momentum method (b) the box method, and (c) the tiny box method ⁸⁶	42
Figure 3-14 Supply Diffuser in Corridor-1	43
Figure 3-15 Supply Diffuser in Corridors-2	44
Figure 3-16 Computation validation with Experimental Results	48
Figure 3-17 Modified Ventilation Arrangement in General Patient Ward Corridors.....	51
Figure 3-18 Research Methodology; Interchange and Interconnection between Experimental and Computational Method	53
Figure 4-1 Aerosol Concentrations Relative to Particle Size (0.5 μ m-3.0 μ m), Time and Distance Under <i>Neutral</i> Ventilation Model for 'A' Series Sampling Locations (1.2m).....	54
Figure 4-2 Aerosol Concentrations Relative to Particle Size (0.5 μ m-3.0 μ m), Time and Distance Under <i>Negative</i> Ventilation Mode for 'A' Series Sampling Locations (1.2m).....	55

Figure 4-3 Aerosol Concentration Relative to Particle Size, Distance and Ventilation Mode	56
Figure 5-1 Velocity Vectors and Streamlines of the Air Entrained by Supply 2, Existing Arrangement. Nursing Station is on the Right Side.....	61
Figure 5-2 Streamlines of the Air Entrained by Supply 2, Modified Arrangement. Nursing Station is on the Right Side.....	61
Figure 5-3 Vortices Created by Introducing New Exhaust Fans. Nursing Station is on the Right Side.....	61
Figure 5-4 Average Particle Concentrations Relative to Distance, <i>Existing</i> Ventilation Arrangement Release <i>Outside</i> ($x=0m$)	63
Figure 5-5 Average Particle Concentrations Relative to Distance, <i>Modified</i> Ventilation Arrangement Release <i>Outside</i> ($x=0m$)	64
Figure 5-6 Average Particle Concentrations Relative to Distance, Existing Ventilation Arrangement and Release Inside ($x=14m$)	65
Figure 5-7 Average Aerosol Concentrations Relative to Distance, Modified Ventilation Arrangement and Release Inside ($x=14m$)	67
Figure 5-8 Particle Distribution, Negative Mode, Case 1.....	69
Figure 5-9 Vertical Distribution of Particles under <i>Negative</i> Mode, <i>Case 1</i>	70
Figure 5-10 Lateral Distribution of Particles under Negative Mode, Case 1	71

Figure 5-11 Particle Maximum Residence Distribution; Negative Mode, Case 1	72
Figure 5-12 Particle Distance Traveled Distribution; Negative Model, Case 1	72
Figure 5-13 Particle Distribution, Neutral Mode, Case 1	73
Figure 5-14 Vertical Distribution of Particles under Neutral Mode, Case 1	74
Figure 5-15 Lateral Distribution of Particles under Neutral Mode, Case 1	75
Figure 5-16 Particle Maximum Residence Distribution; Neutral Mode, Case 1	75
Figure 5-17 Particle Distance Traveled Distribution; Neutral Model, Case 1	76
Figure 5-18 Particle Distribution, Negative Mode, Case 2	78
Figure 5-19 Vertical Distribution of Particles under Negative Mode, Case 2	78
Figure 5-20 Lateral Distribution of Particles under Negative Mode, Case 2	79
Figure 5-21 Particle Maximum Residence Distribution; Negative Mode, Case 2	80
Figure 5-22 Particle Distance Traveled Distribution; Negative Model, Case 2	81
Figure 5-23 Particle Distribution, Neutral Mode, Case 2	82
Figure 5-24 Vertical Distribution of Particles under Neutral Mode, Case 2	83
Figure 5-25 Lateral Distribution of Particles under Neutral Mode, Case 2	83
Figure 5-26 Particle Maximum Residence Distribution; Neutral Mode, Case 2	84
Figure 5-27 Particle Distance Traveled Distribution; <i>Neutral</i> Model, <i>Case 2</i>	85

Figure 5-28 Skewness and Kurtosis in Distributions ⁹⁷	87
Figure 5-29 Particle Distribution, Negative Mode, Case 3	88
Figure 5-30 Particle Distribution, Negative Mode, Case 3	88
Figure 5-31 Lateral Distribution of Particles under Negative Mode, Case 2	89
Figure 5-32 Particle Maximum Residence Distribution; Negative Mode, Case 3	90
Figure 5-33 Particle Distance Traveled Distribution; <i>Negative Model, Case 3</i>	90
Figure 5-34 Particle Distribution, Neutral Mode, Case 3	91
Figure 5-35 Vertical Distribution of Particles under Neutral Mode, Case 3	92
Figure 5-36 Lateral Distribution of Particles under Neutral Mode, Case 3	92
Figure 5-37 Particle Maximum Residence Distribution; Neutral Mode, Case 3	93
Figure 5-38 Particle Distance Traveled Distribution; Neutral Model, Case 3	94
Figure 5-39 Particle Distribution, Negative Mode, Case 4	95
Figure 5-40 Vertical Distribution of Particles under Negative Mode, Case 4	96
Figure 5-41 Lateral Distribution of Particles under Negative Mode, Case 4	97
Figure 5-42 Particle Maximum Residence Distribution; Negative Mode, Case 4	98
Figure 5-43 Particle Distance Traveled Distribution; Negative Model, Case 4	98
Figure 5-44 Particle Distribution, Neutral Mode, Case 4	99

Figure 5-45 Vertical Distribution of Particles under <i>Neutral Mode, Case 4</i>	100
Figure 5-46 Lateral Distribution of Particles under <i>Neutral Mode, Case 4</i>	100
Figure 5-47 Particle Maximum Residence Distribution; <i>Neutral Mode, Case 4</i>	101
Figure 5-48 Particle Distance Traveled Distribution; <i>Neutral Mode, Case 4</i>	102
Figure 5-49 Particle Concentrations versus ACH, Existing Arrangement, Release Outside ($x=0m$)	105
Figure 5-50 Particle Concentrations versus ACH, <i>Modified</i> Arrangement, Release <i>Outside</i> ($x=0m$)	107
Figure 5-51 Particle Average Concentration Relative to ACH, <i>Released Outside</i> ($x=0m$)	108
Figure 5-52 Particle Concentrations versus ACH, <i>Existing</i> Arrangement, Release <i>Inside</i> ($x=14m$)	109
Figure 5-53 Particle Concentrations versus ACH, <i>Modified</i> Arrangement, Release <i>Inside</i> ($x=14m$)	111
Figure 5-54 Particle Average Concentration Relative to ACH, <i>Released Inside</i> ($x=14m$)	113
Figure 5-55 Distance from Source Relative to Ventilation Rate, <i>Case 1</i>	115
Figure 5-56 Distance from Source Relative to Ventilation Rate, <i>Case 2</i>	118

Figure 5-57 Vertical Distribution of Particles under 2ACH, <i>Case 3</i>	119
Figure 5-58 Lateral Distribution of Particles under 2ACH, <i>Case 3</i>	120
Figure 5-59 Particle Maximum Residence Time Distribution, 2ACH, <i>Case 3</i>	120
Figure 5-60 Particle Distance Traveled Distribution, 2ACH, <i>Case 3</i>	121
Figure 5-61 Vertical Distribution of Particles under 3ACH, <i>Case 3</i>	122
Figure 5-62 Lateral Distribution of Particles under 3ACH, <i>Case 3</i>	122
Figure 5-63 Particle Maximum Residence Time Distribution, 3ACH, <i>Case 3</i>	123
Figure 5-64 Particle Distance Traveled Distribution, 3ACH, <i>Case 3</i>	123
Figure 5-65 Vertical Distribution of Particles under 4ACH, <i>Case 3</i>	124
Figure 5-66 Lateral Distribution of Particles under 4ACH, <i>Case 3</i>	125
Figure 5-67 Particle Maximum Residence Time Distribution, 4ACH, <i>Case 3</i>	125
Figure 5-68 Particle Distance Traveled Distribution, 4ACH, <i>Case 3</i>	126
Figure 5-69 Vertical Distribution of Particles under 2ACH, <i>Case 4</i>	128
Figure 5-70 Lateral Distribution of Particles under 2ACH, <i>Case 4</i>	128
Figure 5-71 Particle Maximum Residence Time Distribution, 2ACH, <i>Case 4</i>	129
Figure 5-72 Particle Distance Traveled Distribution, 2ACH, <i>Case 4</i>	129
Figure 5-73 Vertical Distribution of Particles under 3ACH, <i>Case 4</i>	130

Figure 5-74 Lateral Distribution of Particles under 3ACH, <i>Case 4</i>	131
Figure 5-75 Particle Maximum Residence Time Distribution, 3ACH, <i>Case 4</i>	131
Figure 5-76 Particle Distance Traveled Distribution, 3ACH, <i>Case 4</i>	132
Figure 5-77 Vertical Distribution of Particles under 4ACH, <i>Case 4</i>	133
Figure 5-78 Lateral Distribution of Particles under 4ACH, <i>Case 4</i>	133
Figure 5-79 Particle Maximum Residence Time Distribution, 4ACH, <i>Case 4</i>	134
Figure 5-80 Particle Distance Traveled Distribution, 5ACH, <i>Case 4</i>	135
Figure 5-81 Vertical Distribution of Particles under 5ACH, <i>Case 4</i>	135
Figure 5-82 Lateral Distribution of Particles under 5ACH, <i>Case 4</i>	136
Figure 5-83 Particle Maximum Residence Time Distribution, 5ACH, <i>Case 4</i>	137
Figure 5-84 Particle Distance Traveled Distribution, 5ACH, <i>Case 4</i>	137
Figure 6-1 Particle Concentration and Distribution versus ventilation rate; Existing Arrangement	143
Figure 6-2 Particle Concentration and Distribution versus ventilation rate; <i>Modified</i> Arrangement	143

LIST OF TABLES

Table 3-1 Summary of Test Procedure in Corridors.....	32
Table 3-2 Meshing Accuracy Relative to Mass Flow Rate Values at Boundaries	36
Table 3-3 Scaled Residuals for Conserved Variables.....	37
Table 3-4 Meshing Accuracy Relative to Velocity Field	39
Table 3-5 Boundary Conditions of General Patient Ward Corridors, Neutral vs. Negative Modes.....	45
Table 3-6 Statistical Analysis of Model Validation.....	49
Table 3-7 Boundary Conditions for New CFD Models for Various Ventilation Rates....	52
Table 4-1 Average Change in Particle Concentration Relative to Distance from Release	55
Table 4-2 Probability of Contamination.	58
Table 5-1 Particle Concentrations Relative to Distance; Negative vs. Neutral Modes, Existing vs. Modified Arrangements, Release <i>Outside</i> ($x=0m$)	63
Table 5-2 Particle Concentrations Relative to Distance; Negative vs. Neutral Modes, Existing vs. Modified Arrangements, Release <i>Inside</i> ($x=0m$)	66
Table 5-3 Average Particle Concentrations Relative to Ventilation Alignment; Negative versus Neutral	68

Table 5-4 Removal By Ventilation System Relative to Exhaust Fan Placement; <i>Negative</i> Mode, <i>Case 1</i>	71
Table 5-5 Removal By Ventilation System Relative to Exhaust Fan Placement; <i>Neutral</i> Mode, <i>Case 1</i>	76
Table 5-6 Distribution Parameters Relative to Ventilation Alignment, <i>Case 1</i>	77
Table 5-7 Removal By Ventilation System Relative to Exhaust Fan Placement; <i>Negative</i> Mode, <i>Case 2</i>	81
Table 5-8 Removal By Ventilation System Relative to Exhaust Fan Placement;	85
Table 5-9 Distribution Parameters Relative to Ventilation Alignment, <i>Case 2</i>	86
Table 5-10 Removal By Ventilation System Relative to Exhaust Fan Placement;	91
Table 5-11 Removal By Ventilation System Relative to Exhaust Fan Placement;	94
Table 5-12 Distribution Parameters Relative to Ventilation Alignment, <i>Case 3</i>	95
Table 5-13 Removal By Ventilation System Relative to Exhaust Fan Placement;	99
Table 5-14 Removal By Ventilation System Relative to Exhaust Fan Placement;	102
Table 5-15 Distribution Parameters Relative to Ventilation Alignment, <i>Case 4</i>	103
Table 5-16 Particle Concentrations (gr/m^3) versus Ventilation Rate; <i>Existing</i> Arrangement, Release <i>Outside</i> ($x=0\text{m}$)	105

Table 5-17 Ventilation Costs Relative to Average Concentrations; Existing Arrangement, Release <i>Outside</i> ($x=0m$).....	106
Table 5-18 Particle Concentrations (gr/m^3) versus Ventilation Rate; <i>Modified</i> Arrangement, Release <i>Outside</i> ($x=0m$)	107
Table 5-19 Ventilation Costs Relative to Average Concentrations; <i>Modified</i> Arrangement, Release <i>Outside</i> ($x=0m$)	108
Table 5-20 Particle Concentrations (gr/m^3) versus Ventilation Rate; <i>Existing</i> Arrangement, Release <i>Inside</i> ($x=14m$)	110
Table 5-21 Ventilation Costs Relative to Average Concentrations; <i>Existing</i> Arrangement, Release <i>Inside</i> ($x=14m$)	111
Table 5-22 Particle Concentrations (gr/m^3) versus Ventilation Rate; <i>Modified</i> Arrangement, Release <i>Inside</i> ($x=14m$)	112
Table 5-23 Ventilation Costs Relative to Average Concentrations; <i>Modified</i> Arrangement, Release <i>Inside</i> ($x=14m$)	113
Table 5-24 Distribution Parameters Relative to Ventilation Rates, <i>Case 1</i>	114
Table 5-25 Ventilation Costs Relative to Distribution Parameters, <i>Case 1</i>	116
Table 5-26 Distribution Parameters Relative to Ventilation Rates, <i>Case 2</i>	117
Table 5-27 Ventilation Costs Relative to Distribution Parameters, <i>Case 2</i>	118

Table 5-28 Removal By Ventilation System Relative to Ventilation Rate; <i>Case 3</i>	126
Table 5-29 Distribution Parameters Relative to Ventilation Rate, <i>Case 3</i>	127
Table 5-30 Removal By Ventilation System Relative to Ventilation Rate; <i>Case 4</i>	138
Table 5-31 Distribution Parameters Relative to Ventilation Rate, <i>Case 4</i>	139

PREVIEW

LIST OF SYMBOLS

Latin Symbols

c	= contaminant concentration (kg/s)
c_0	= Supply air contaminant concentration (kg/s)
c_i	= initial contaminant concentration (kg/s)
c_e	= ending contaminant concentration (kg/s)
C_c	= Cunningham slip correction factor (-)
C_D	= Drag coefficient (-)
C_p	= Heat capacity at constant pressure (J/kg.°K)
D	= Number of disease cases
dp	= Particle diameter (m)
$d_{i,j}$	= Rate of deformation tensor (-)
\vec{g}	= Gravitational acceleration vector (m/s ²)
g	= Skewness (-)
I	= Number of infectors (-)
K	= Turbulence Kinetic Energy (m ² /s ²)
n	= air change rate (hour ⁻¹)
$n(t)$	= Brownian force (N)
p	= Breathing rate per person (-); Pressure (Pa)

\bar{p}	= Time averaged pressure (Pa)
p'	= Pressure fluctuation (Pa)
q	= quantum generation rate (-)
Q	= Ventilation Rate (m ³ /s)
P_T	= Probability of transport (-)
R^2	= Determination correlation (-)
Re	= Reynolds number (-)
S	= Number of susceptible (-)
\vec{u}	= Velocity field vector (m/s)
\vec{u}_p	= Particle velocity field vector (m/s)
t	= Time (s)
$u_x; u_y; u_z$	= Velocity components in x, y, z directions (m/s)
$u'_x; u'_y; u'_z$	= Fluctuating velocity components in x, y, z directions (m/s)
$\bar{u}_x; \bar{u}_y; \bar{u}_z$	= Time averaged velocity components in x, y, z directions (m/s)
V	= Volume (m ³)
\dot{V}_{pol}	= Contaminant generation rate (kg/s)
$x; y; z$	= Cartesian coordinates (m)

Greek Symbols

β	= Kurtosis of sample
---------	----------------------

σ sample	= Stefan-Boltzmann constant ($\text{W/m}^2\text{K}^4$); Standard Deviation of
μ	= Dynamic viscosity (Pa.s)
ξ	= Gaussian random number (-)
π	= Constant equal to 3.1415 (-)
ρ	= Density of air (kg/m^3)
ρ_p	= Density of particle (kg/m^3)